# Computer Reconstruction of Small Graphs

B. D. McKay

## ABSTRACT

The Reconstruction Conjecture is established for graphs with nine vertices.

### **1. INTRODUCTION**

The purpose of this note is to report recent computational work on graphical reconstruction. Surveys of theoretical work on this subject can be found in [2] and [4]. For each  $n \ge 2$ , let  $\mathscr{G}_n$  denote the family of all graphs with vertex set  $\{v_1, v_2, \ldots, v_n\}$  and let  $I_n$  denote the set  $\{1, 2, \ldots, n\}$ . If  $G \in \mathscr{G}_n$  and  $i \in I_n$ , define  $G_i$  to be the subgraph of G formed by removing the vertex  $v_i$ . We shall consider three conjectures.

**Conjecture 1.** Let  $G, H \in \mathcal{G}_n$ , where n > 2. If  $G_i \cong H_i$  for each  $i \in I_n$ , then  $G \cong H$ . (This conjecture is commonly called the Reconstruction Conjecture.)

**Conjecture 2.** Let  $G, H \in \mathcal{G}_n$ , where n > 3. Suppose that for any  $i, j \in I_n$  there exists  $k, l \in I_n$  such that  $G_i \cong H_k$  and  $H_j \cong G_l$ . Then  $G \cong H$ . (This conjecture was first made by Harary [3].)

**Conjecture 3.** Let  $G, H \in \mathcal{G}_n$ , where n > 5. Suppose that for any  $i, j \in I_n$  there exists  $k, l \in I_n$  such that  $G_i$  is isomorphic to either  $H_k$  or  $\overline{H}_k$  and  $H_j$  is isomorphic to either  $G_l$  or  $\overline{G}_l$ . Then G is isomorphic to either H or  $\overline{H}$ .

Journal of Graph Theory, Vol. 1 (1977) 281–283 Copyright © 1977 by John Wiley & Sons, Inc. 282 JOURNAL OF GRAPH THEORY



FIGURE 1. Largest counterexample to conjecture 3 for  $n \le 5$ .

If Conjecture 3 holds for some fixed  $G \in \mathcal{Q}_n$  and arbitrary  $H \in \mathcal{Q}_n$ , it also holds for  $\overline{G}$ , since  $(\overline{G})_i = (\overline{G_i})$  for any  $i \in I_n$ . This fact allows Conjecture 3 to be tested on the computer in just over half the time required to test Conjecture 2, thus justifying our introduction of Conjecture 3.

The largest counterexamples to Conjecture 3 for  $n \le 5$  is shown in Figure 1. It is easily verified that  $G_1 \cong G_2 \cong H_1 \cong H_2 \cong \overline{H}_5$ ,  $G_3 \cong G_4 \cong H_4$ , and  $G_5 \cong \overline{H}_3$ .

#### 2. RESULTS

Conjecture 1 has been previously verified by Stockmeyer for  $3 \le n \le 8$ and by McKay and Godsil for n = 9 (both unpublished). In this note we report the following stronger result.

**Theorem.** Conjectures 1, 2, and 3 are true for  $6 \le n \le 9$ .

It is only necessary to verify Conjecture 3, since it is clearly stronger than either of the other conjectures. The computation is now briefly described for n = 9.

First, a linear ordering on  $\mathscr{G}_n$  was devised, using the degrees of the vertices and the canonically labelled adjacency matrix of each graph [6]. Relative to this ordering, a list of the 137,352 9-vertex graphs with  $G \leq \overline{G}$  was prepared from the graphs generated by Baker, Dewdney, and Szilard [1]. For each graph G of this list, generators for the automorphism group were found, and for one value of *i* from each orbit, the graph min( $G_i, \overline{G}_i$ ) was constructed and canonically labelled. This required the canonical labelling algorithm of [6] to be applied over 1.1 million times to 8-vertex graphs. Isomorphic graphs were then eliminated from the set thus associated with each 9-vertex graph. Finally, a search revealed that no two of these sets were the same. The total execution time (CDC Cyber 70 model 73) for n = 9 was about 71 min.

An incidental outcome of the computation was the production of those graphs with 8 or 9 vertices having pseudosimilar vertices [5]. Vertices  $v_i$ and  $v_i$  of G are *pseudosimilar* if  $G_i \cong G_i$  but there is no automorphism of G taking  $v_i$  onto  $v_j$ . There are 44 such graphs with 8 vertices and 454 with 9 vertices. A listing of these is available from the author.

#### References

- [1] H. Baker, A. Dewdney, and A. Szilard, Generating the nine-point graphs. *Math. Comput.* 28, 127 (1974) 833-838.
- [2] J. A. Bondy and R. L. Hemminger, Graph reconstruction—a survey. J. Graph Theory 1 (1977) 227-268.
- [3] F. Harary, On the reconstruction of a graph from a collection of subgraphs. Theory of Graphs and its Applications. Academic Press, New York (1964) 47-52.
- [4] F. Harary, A survey of the reconstruction conjecture. Graphs and Combinatorics. Springer-Verlag, Berlin (1974) 18-28.
- [5] F. Harary and E. M. Palmer, On similar points of a graph. J. Math. Mech. 15, 4 (1966) 623-630.
- [6] B. D. McKay, Backtrack programming and the graph isomorphism problem. Masters Thesis, Melbourne University (1976).